On the measurements of neutrino energy spectra and nuclear effects in neutrino-nucleus interactions

Xianguo LU (盧 顕国) University of Oxford Kyoto HE Seminar 29 July 2016

Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

References: arXiv:1512.05748 and 1507.00967, unless otherwise specified.







X.-G. Lu, Oxford





29 July 2016

1. Neutrino interactions on static nucleon

Static nucleon target



1. Neutrino interactions on static nucleon

- > Static nucleon target, charged current (CC) $v \rightarrow l'$, quasi-elastic (QE) N \rightarrow N'
 - Detection via charged lepton
 - ✓ Neutrino energy ← charged lepton kinematics





1. Neutrino interactions on static nucleon

- > Static nucleon target, charged current (CC) $v \rightarrow I'$, quasi-elastic (QE) N \rightarrow N'
 - Detection via charged lepton

 - Lepton and hadron transversely balanced



- Nucleus (bound nucleon) target
 - Fermi motion (FM) biases neutrino energy reconstruction



- Nucleus (bound nucleon) target
 - Fermi motion (FM) biases neutrino energy reconstruction
 - Multinucleon correlations: cross section unknown, strong bias to all final state kinematics x



initial nucleon in correlation with another in large relative motion

Properties largely unknown, for simplicity no further discussion here. See more detail in arXiv:1512.05748.

29 July 2016

- > Nucleus (bound nucleon) target, CC $\nu \rightarrow I'$, QE N \rightarrow N'
 - Fermi motion (FM) biases neutrino energy reconstruction
 - Multinucleon correlations: cross section unknown, strong bias to all final state kinematics
 - × QE-like: QE faked by resonance production (RES) Δ → N'π π absorbed in nucleus ← final state interaction (FSI)



- ≻ Nucleus (bound nucleon) target, CC $\nu \rightarrow I'$, QE N \rightarrow N'
 - Fermi motion (FM) biases neutrino energy reconstruction
 - * Multinucleon correlations: cross section unknown, strong bias to *all* final state kinematics
 - $\star\,$ QE-like: QE faked by resonance production (RES) $\Delta \rightarrow$ N' π
 - π absorbed in nucleus \leftarrow final state interaction (FSI)
 - \star FSI \rightarrow energy-momentum transferred in nucleus, possible nuclear emission



- Nucleus (bound nucleon) target
 - * Nuclear effects: FM, multinucleon correlations, FSI, etc.
 - Transverse momenta NOT balanced











Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

2. Minimal energy dependent measurement of nuclear effects



2. Energy dependence of final state kinematics



4-momentum transfer: Q^2 Invariant mass of N': *W* Ignoring binding energy,

$$\omega \sim \frac{Q^2 + W^2 - m_{\rm N}^2}{2\sqrt{m_{\rm N}^2 + p_{\rm N}^2}}$$

($p_{
m N}^2/2m_{
m N}^2\simeq 2\%$ effect of Fermi motion)

Quasi-elastic scattering (QE):

$$\nu n \to \ell^- p$$

Resonance production (RES):

$$\nu p \to \ell^- \Delta^{++} \to \ell^- p \pi^+$$

For QE and RES, $Q^2 << m_N^2$ (interaction length) W is nucleon or resonance mass. ω "saturates" when $E_v > O(m_N/2)$

- Lepton retains most of the increase of neutrino energy
- Hadronic kinematics much less E_{v} -dependent than leptonic ones

29 July 2016

N' mom. saturates with large neutrino energy.

FSI all determined by N' momentum: 1. In-medium interaction probability τ_{f} saturates





N' mom. saturates with large neutrino energy. ٩ FSI all determined by N' momentum: 0.8 N' mom. saturation 1. In-medium interaction probability $\tau_{_{\rm f}}$ saturates 0.6 2. Energy-momentum transfer $(\Delta E, \Delta \vec{p})$ from N' NuWro, $v_{\mu}C(RFG)$, QE to the nucleus also saturate ••••• $E_v = 0.6 \text{ GeV}, \tau_f = 0.22$ 0.4 $E_v = 1$ GeV, $\tau_f = 0.25$ $E_{v}=3$ GeV, $\tau_{f}=0.28$ 0.2 ••••• $E_y = 6 \text{ GeV}, \tau_z = 0.28$ 00 100 200 300 500 400 $\Delta p (\text{MeV}/c)$



N' mom. saturates with large neutrino energy.

FSI all determined by N' momentum: 1. In-medium interaction probability τ_{f} saturates 2. Energy-momentum transfer $(\Delta E, \Delta \vec{p})$ from N' to the nucleus also saturate

Medium response: Nuclear emission: nucleus being excited or broken-up, emitting particles. Probability: $P(\Delta E)$





N' mom. saturates with large neutrino energy. ٩ FSI all determined by N' momentum: 0.8 N' mom. saturation 1. In-medium interaction probability τ_{f} saturates 0.6 2. Energy-momentum transfer $(\Delta E, \Delta \vec{p})$ from N' NuWro, $v_{\mu}C(RFG)$, QE to the nucleus also saturate. ••••• $E_v = 0.6 \text{ GeV}, \tau_e = 0.22$ 0.4 E_v=1 GeV, τ_c=0.25 Medium response: $E_{v} = 3 \text{ GeV}, \tau_{c} = 0.28$ 0.2 ••••• $E_v = 6 \text{ GeV}, \tau_i = 0.28$ Nuclear emission: nucleus being excited or 00 broken-up, emitting particles. 100 200 300 500 400 Probability: $P(\Delta E)$ $\Delta p (\text{MeV}/c)$

• $(\Delta E, \Delta \vec{p})$ fully determine nuclear response – ideal variables to characterize FSI.



- Neutrinos produced by accelerators have well understood directions.
- Momentum conservation applies in all directions of the neutrino-nucleus interaction system.

 \rightarrow neutrino-**nucleon** kinematic imbalance =

nuclear effects



- Neutrinos produced by accelerators have well understood directions.
- Momentum conservation applies in all directions of the neutrino-nucleus interaction system.

→ neutrino-**nucleon** kinematic imbalance = nuclear effects

Neutrino energy unknown, use transverse projection

$$\rightarrow \delta \vec{p}_{\mathrm{T}} = \vec{p}_{\mathrm{T}}^{\mathrm{N}} - \Delta \vec{p}_{\mathrm{T}}$$

To first order, nuclear effects can be determined independently on neutrino energy.







Limited energy evolution with FSI strength

Counterexample

Strong – inverted – energy evolution contains lepton kinematics $\delta \phi_{\tau} \sim \delta p_{\tau}/q_{\tau}$



; тр. 1.4 Extension (c) NuWro, NuMI on-axis flux, .C(RFG), QE 1.2 $\dots M_{\Lambda}^{QE} = 0.8 \text{ GeV}$ $M_{\Delta}^{QE} = 1.2 \text{ GeV}$ M^QE = 1.6 GeV 0.8 0.6 Proton momentum Counterexample 0.4 <u>×1</u>0⁻³ 0.2 0 5 p.d.f. 0.5 1.5 2 2.5 3 (a) NuWro, NuMI on-axis flux, $\nu_{\mu}C(RFG)$, QE 6 $p_{\rm n}~({\rm GeV}/c)$ $ec{p}_{ ext{T}}^{\ell'}$ ••••• $M_{\rm A}^{\rm QE} = 0.8 \, {\rm GeV}$ 5 $- M_{\rm A}^{\rm QE} = 1.6 \, {\rm GeV}$ 4 $\vec{p}_{\ell'}$ 3 2 1 $-\delta \phi_{\rm T}$ 0 100 200 300 500 600 0 400 $\vec{q}_{\mathrm{T}} = -\vec{p}_{\mathrm{T}}^{\ell'}$ $\delta \rho_{_{
m T}}$ (MeV/c) $\vec{p}_{\mathbf{N}'}$ $\delta ec p_{1}$ $\delta \alpha_{\mathrm{T}}$ $\delta \vec{p}_{\rm T} = \vec{p}_{\rm T}^{\rm N}$ $\Delta ec{p_{\mathrm{T}}}$ invariant w/ nucleon-level physics **FSI** FM 29 July 2016 X.-G. Lu, Oxford 32

Application



Directly showing initial state, useful to study new target material

Application



- In RES, N' = proton + pion, sensitive to pion FSI
- Useful to study FSI in anti-neutrino interaction (anti-nu CCQE N'=neutron)




2. State-of-the-art probes of nuclear effects



Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

3. Nuclear effect-independent reconstruction of neutrino energy



3. Hydrogen as neutrino interaction target



X.-G. Lu, Oxford

3. Hydrogen as neutrino interaction target

- Pure hydrogen
 - Technical requirement:
 - bubble chamber (historical: 73, 79, 78, 82, 86)



- Safety issue: explosive

LBNE design report, FERMILAB-PUB-14-022

- "Since the use of a liquid H2 bubble chamber is excluded in the ND hall due to safety concerns, ..."
- In the last ~30 years there has been no new measurement of neutrino interactions on pure hydrogen.

3. Double-transverse kinematic imbalance

Lepton-proton interaction \rightarrow 3 charged particles: $l p \rightarrow l' X Y$

- Leading order realization in standard model:

{X, Y}
= {p,
$$\pi^+$$
} for $\nu + p \rightarrow \ell^- + \Delta^{++}$
or {p, π^- } for $\bar{\nu} + p \rightarrow \ell^+ + \Delta^0$



3. Double-transverse kinematic imbalance

Lepton-proton interaction \rightarrow 3 charged particles: $l p \rightarrow l' X Y$

- Leading order realization in standard model:



3. Double-transverse kinematic imbalance

Lepton-proton interaction \rightarrow 3 charged particles: $l p \rightarrow l' X Y$

- Leading order realization in standard model:



3. Hydrogen doping



$$\delta p_{\rm TT} \equiv p_{\rm TT}^{\rm p} + p_{\rm TT}^{\pi}$$

- Hydrogen: 0
- Heavier nuclei: irreducible symmetric broadening
 - by Fermi motion O(200 MeV)
 - further by FSI

3. Hydrogen doping



Double-transverse momentum imbalance

$$\delta p_{\rm TT} \equiv p_{\rm TT}^{\rm p} + p_{\rm TT}^{\pi}$$

- Hydrogen: 0
- Heavier nuclei: irreducible symmetric broadening
 - by Fermi motion O(200 MeV)
 - further by FSI
- Hydrogen doping: adding hydrogen atoms in target material.
- Hydrogen shape is only detector smearing.
 - With good detector resolution, hydrogen yield can be extracted.
 - With very good res., event-by-ev. selection of nu-H interaction is possible.
- *In situ* nuclear-free flux measurement with current technology is possible via *"bin-and-fit"* method (arXiv:1512.09042, see *new* demonstration in Section 6).

X.-G. Lu, Oxford

Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary









Conclusion: large room to improve theories

X.-G. Lu, Oxford

Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

5. Measurement in MINERvA

Nucl.Instrum.Meth. A743 (2014) 130-159



Phys.Rev. D91 (2015) no.7, 071301

- NuMI on-axis neutrino beam, 3 GeV peak energy
- Fine grained scintillator tracker as target
- Event selection: 1 μ , \geq 1 p, 0 π (CCQE-like)
 - » μ reconstruction: tracker, matched to MINOS ND, momentum by range and curvature
 - p reconstruction: ID and momentum by tracker dE/dx profile, momentum threshold 450 MeV
 - > π veto: cut on untracked energy and Michel electrons

X.-G. Lu, Oxford

5. Measurement in MINERvA – selecting ESC protons



29 July 2016

54

5. Measurement in MINERvA – selecting ESC protons





	Spread	Statistics
default	100%	100%
dE/dx	60%	40%
χ^2	70%	60%
$dE/dx + \chi^2$	50%	30%

Neutrino2016 P2.043

29 July 2016

5. Measurement in MINERvA – p_T scale corrections



5. Measurement in MINERvA $- p_T$ scale corrections



5. Measurement in MINERvA – final-state momentum spectra



- In given acceptance, overall spectral shapes not sensitive to FSIs.
- Nuclear effects are difficult to observe on top of kinematics originating from neutrinonucleon interaction level. Direct observables are therefore needed.

5. Measurement in MINERvA – single-T kinematic imbalance





- GENIE predictions in MINERvA acceptance show collinear enhancement discussed previously (Section 4).
- Sensitivity achieved by momentum improvement cuts and corrections.

Neutrino2016 P2.043

29 July 2016

Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

6. Measurement in T2K

Nucl.Instrum.Meth. A659 (2011) 106-135



Event number : 6181 | Partition : 63 | Run number : 4175 | Spill : 0 | SubRun number : 1 | Time : Sat 2010-03-20 12:15:21 JST |Trigger: Beam Spill

- J-PARC off-axis neutrino beam, 600 MeV peak energy
- Fine Grained Detector (FGD1) as CH target
- Event selection: 1 μ , \geq 1 p, 1 π^+
 - PID and tracking: TPC1

X.-G. Lu, Oxford

6. Measurement in T2K – double-T kinematic imbalance



Current objective: Develop signal extraction techniques; Measure v-H cross section – first one since 30 years.

29 July 2016

arXiv:1605.00154

6. Prospects for Current Experiments



Simple performance projection of T2K-like detector using NuWro+T2K flux on CH (ideal acceptance)

arXiv:1512.09042

6. Prospects for Current Experiments



Simple performance projection of T2K-like detector using NuWro+T2K flux on CH (ideal acceptance)

The hydrogen event selection can be improved by

- Veto nuclear emission
- Veto π^0 , γ background
- Improve tracking resolution \rightarrow most critical

Requirement on nuclear physics decreases as resolution improves!

- ✓ Now only need to look at $|\delta p_{\tau\tau}| < O(10 \text{ MeV})$ region.
- In future even a less burden; can be measured w/ pure nuclear target, e.g. graphite.

X.-G. Lu, Oxford





Previous setting (ideal accpt.) but w/ ideal tracking+PID

- 3-particle final state: μ , p, π^{+}
- E_{v} reconstructed as sum of final-state energy

H excl. $p\pi^+$ signal

Fraction: ~ 20% (blue-shifted peak) – 10% (tail)



29 July 2016

X.-G. Lu, Oxford

66





6. Potentials in Near-Future Experiments

- T2K-II ND for *in situ* nuclear-free flux measurement
 - Has free hydrogens (CH and H₂O)
 - Capable of momentum and PID measurement of muons, protons, pions
 - Need to optimize configuration for momentum resolution, and for acceptance for high statistics. A higher B-field is a more expensive but very effective way to improve the resolution.
 - Calorimetry capability to veto nuclear emission and electromagnetic background.
 - Nuclear physics in $|\delta p_{TT}| < O(10 \text{ MeV})$ can be measured *in situ* with embedded graphite target.

Outline

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Measuring nuclear effects w/ minimal dependence on neutrino energy
- 3. Measuring neutrino energy independent of nuclear effects
- 4. Theory predictions
- 5. Measurement in MINERvA
- 6. Measurement in T2K
- 7. Summary

7. Summary

- Understanding nuclear effects is crucial for neutrino physics at GeV regime, deeply related to solving matter-antimatter asymmetry of our current universe.
- For neutrinos provided by accelerators, one can use transverse kinematic imbalance to maximally disentangle nuclear effects and neutrino energy uncertainty.
- Experimental efforts are under way. By exploring this new technique, we aim to provide critical physics input in neutrino interactions, and demonstrate/apply novel flux constraining techniques for future experiments.
- Outlook
 - Current measurements:
 - T2K-ND, MINERvA
 - Potential measurements in current experiments:
 - TK2-INGRID, T60, NOvA, µBooNE
 - Potential measurements in future experiments:
 - T2K-II-ND, DUNE-ND

BACKUP




Neutrino energy 1 GeV

6. Measurement in T2K



Nucl.Instrum.Meth. A659 (2011) 106-135

v beam: off-axis, peak ~ 600 MeV

X.-G. Lu, Oxford



29 July 2016

4785; 4948